APPLICATION NO	PA/2017/547
APPLICANT	Mr Daniel Abbott
DEVELOPMENT	Planning permission to erect an agricultural building for livestock
LOCATION	Field west of Brigadoon, The Turbary, Belton, DN9 1QE
PARISH	Belton
WARD	Axholme Central
CASE OFFICER	Scott Jackson
SUMMARY RECOMMENDATION	Refuse permission
REASONS FOR REFERENCE TO COMMITTEE	Officer discretion (at the request of the Group Manager – Development Management & Building Control)

POLICIES

National Planning Policy Framework: Paragraph 56 states that good design is a key aspect of sustainable development and is invisible from good planning and should contribute positively to making places better for people.

Paragraph 109 states the planning system should contribute to and enhance the natural and local environment by:

- protecting and enhancing valued landscapes, geological conservation interests and soils;
- recognising the wider benefits of ecosystem services;
- minimising impacts on biodiversity and providing net gains in biodiversity where possible, contributing to the Government's commitment to halt the overall decline in biodiversity, including by establishing coherent ecological networks that are more resilient to current and future pressures;
- preventing both new and existing development from contributing to or being put at unacceptable risk from, or being adversely affected by unacceptable levels of soil, air, water or noise pollution or land instability; and
- remediating and mitigating despoiled, degraded, derelict, contaminated and unstable land, where appropriate.

Paragraph 128 states in determining applications, local planning authorities should require an applicant to describe the significance of any heritage assets affected, including any contribution made by their setting. The level of detail should be proportionate to the assets' importance and no more than is sufficient to understand the potential impact of the proposal on their significance. As a minimum the relevant historic environment record should have been consulted and the heritage assets assessed using appropriate expertise where necessary. Where a site on which development is proposed includes or has the potential to include heritage assets with archaeological interest, local planning authorities should require developers to submit an appropriate desk-based assessment and, where necessary, a field evaluation.

Paragraph 133 states that where a proposed development will lead to substantial harm to, or total loss of significance of, a designated heritage asset, local planning authorities should refuse consent, unless it can be demonstrated that the substantial harm or loss is necessary to achieve substantial public benefits that outweigh that harm or loss, or all of the following apply:

- the nature of the heritage asset prevents all reasonable uses of the site; and
- no viable use of the heritage asset itself can be found in the medium term through appropriate marketing that will enable its conservation; and
- conservation by grant-funding or some form of charitable or public ownership is demonstrably not possible; and
- the harm or loss is outweighed by the benefit of bringing the site back into use.

North Lincolnshire Local Plan: Policies DS1, DS16, RD2, RD14, LC14 and T2 apply.

North Lincolnshire Core Strategy: Policies CS1, CS2, CS3, CS5, CS6 and CS19 apply.

CONSULTATIONS

Highways: No objection or comments.

Environment Agency: The site is within Flood Zone 3, indicating a high probability of flooding. The application doesn't include a Flood Risk Assessment as required by the National Planning Policy Framework. However, owing to the scale and nature of the proposal, there is no objection.

Environmental Health: No objection. Recommend a condition requiring a scheme for the collection, storage and disposal of manure and foul bedding to be submitted for consideration.

Historic Environment Record: The application site lies within the Area of Special Historic Landscape Interest of the Isle of Axholme (Local Plan Policy LC14). This area is designated for its unique historic landscape retaining the pattern of medieval open strip fields surrounding the villages, as well as the parish Turbaries; this application is located within Stockholes Turbary.

Further to the previous application on this site (PA/2017/86), the HER advised the applicant to submit sufficient information to accord with the requirements of National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF), paragraph 128; photographic information accompanies the current application but other details are lacking. The applicant has reduced the height of the proposed building from 5. metres to 4 metres and amended the building materials. These measures lessen the negative impact of the building on the character, appearance and setting of the historic turbary, though issues remain of the overall scale and design of a

livestock building within this plot and further details should be submitted prior to determination.

The application should then be considered against relevant planning policies that include North Lincolnshire Local Plan policies LC7, LC14 and RD2; Core Strategy policy CS6; and NPPF paragraphs 131 and 137. If the planning authority is minded to grant permission, appropriate conditions would be needed to secure the implementation of the submitted plans and details.

PARISH COUNCIL

Objects on the grounds that the design of the proposed building is not of a suitable design for agricultural use and has the appearance of a commercial building.

PUBLICITY

A site notice has been displayed. Eleven letters of objection (including seven from anonymous contributors) and two letters of support have been received. The letters of objection raise the following issues:

- not of suitable design
- unsuitable building for housing cattle
- no drainage or ventilation for the building
- odour from manure and slurry
- no odour plan has been submitted
- potential for contamination of local watercourses
- impact on LC14 land
- the scale the building is out of keeping
- poor access to the site for HGVs
- lack of supporting evidence
- contradictory intentions by the application in terms of the use of the proposed building
- method of surface water disposal
- the design of the building is unsuitable for livestock (roller shutter door, no ventilation)
- the applicant intends to use the building for vehicle repairs
- two scrap cars, two trailers and two banger racing cars have been brought onto the site
- the rural look of the turbary will be compromised.

ASSESSMENT

This application was deferred at the last meeting of the planning committee to enable members to visit the site prior to making a decision.

The site is a field located outside the development boundary of Belton, within the open countryside. The site is located approximately 2 kilometres (or 1.25 miles) to the west and south-west of the built framework of Belton. The site is located within an Area of Special Historic Landscape as defined under policy LC14 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan. The site is located within Stockholes Turbary which, along with the medieval open strip fields, is of national importance. The enclosed nature of the land and overall settlement pattern of the area make it unique. The character of development in this part of the Stockholes Turbary consists of two or three original smallholder cottages and more recent dwellings of modest size, most one-and-a-half storeys. The outbuildings in the vicinity are generally modest structures such as field shelters or small timber buildings, although there is a larger outbuilding to the east of the site on the Brigadoon property. The site is located in flood zone 2/3a. The site is located close to Hatfield Chase Ditches SSSI.

Planning permission is being sought to erect an agricultural building to accommodate cows. This is a resubmission of planning application PA/2017/86 which was refused for an agricultural building on the same site measuring 24.7 metres by 9.3 metres with a height of 5.39 metres. This application seeks an agricultural building with a reduced height of 3.962 metres constructed in blockwork with a reclaimed brick to the outer wall and a dark red tin sheet roof. The building is proposed in the north-western corner of the field.

The main issues in the determination of this planning application are the principle of development and impact on the character and appearance of the Area of Special Historic Landscape Interest.

Principle

The application site lies outside the defined settlement boundaries for both Epworth and Belton on land classed as open countryside. Policy RD2 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan therefore applies which states that development in the open countryside will be strictly controlled and will only be allowed for development which is essential to the efficient operation of agriculture or forestry, provided that the following criteria are met:

- (a) the open countryside is the only appropriate location and development cannot reasonably be accommodated within defined development boundaries
- (b) the proposed development accords with the specific requirements set out in the relevant policies of this chapter and elsewhere in this local plan
- (c) the development would not be detrimental to the character or appearance of the open countryside or a nearby settlement in terms of siting, scale, massing, design and use of materials, and
- (d) the development would not be detrimental to residential amenity or highway safety, and
- (e) account is taken of whether the site is capable of being served by public transport, and

(f) the development is sited to make the best use of existing and new landscaping.

The applicant has submitted additional information in support of this application by way of photographs. However, other than the planning application form, which states that the building is required to accommodate cows, no additional supporting justification has been provided with this resubmitted application, such as the number of cows on the site, why this type of building is required and for what purpose. In terms of its design, the plans show a building constructed from blockwork with a reclaimed brick to the outer wall and a tin sheet metal roof. The plans also show a mono-pitch roof design with a roller shutter door and two further access doors. The building measures 24.7 metres by 9.3 metres. No details have been provided to justify the requirement for a roller shutter door to serve the livestock building, no details of ventilation have been submitted, the building is fully enclosed and no internal layout plan has been submitted.

Whilst a building proposed to accommodate livestock in a rural area is considered acceptable in principle, it is the lack of justification for a building to accommodate cows that is the issue to consider in this case.

Whilst it is acknowledged that the applicant has taken measures to reduce the height of the proposed building by 1.428 metres (when compared to the previous application) and altered the external appearance with a reclaimed brick finish, it is considered that the overall scale (floor area of approximately 230 square metres) and bulk of the proposed agricultural building would be out of keeping with the character, appearance and setting of the historic landscape.

Historic landscape

The proposed agricultural livestock building will be located on land which is designated as LC14 land, the Isle of Axholme Area of Special Historic Landscape. This land is designated for its significant areas of medieval open strip fields and Turbaries, both of which are of considerable national importance. The existing field is relatively square in its dimensions and is reflective of the wider pattern and character of Stockholes Turbary which consists of areas of agricultural smallholdings defined by lines of trees and/or drainage ditches which form the boundaries of the fields; this gives an overall sense of enclosure. Stockholes Turbary is an example where the historic field pattern is well preserved and any development should seek to safeguard its historic landscape and its features.

These enclosed sections of agricultural land are a defining feature of the landscape to the west and south-west of Belton, some of which have small-scale dwellings and agricultural buildings located within them. This agricultural livestock building with spatial dimensions of 24.7 metres by 9.3 metres represents an unnecessary and unjustified intrusion into the Area of Special Historic Landscape, to the detriment of its historic character. The proposal is considered to adversely affect the character, appearance and setting of the historic landscape and its features, particularly as this part of the landscape has buildings of modest scale and height and represents one of the key parts of the landscape with historic views evident.

The building is significant in size, bulk and mass and will be much larger in size compared to the neighbouring properties and buildings. Whilst it is accepted that the proposed agricultural livestock building has been reduced in height since the previous application was considered and the materials of construction have been revised, it is considered that this proposal, when accounting for its scale, design and siting has the potential to adversely affect the historic landscape and its features, exacerbated by the fact that views will be readily available from public footpath BELT42 which runs across the site access lane.

Other issues

In terms of highway issues, concerns have been raised about an increase in HGVs to the site, the suitability of the access and pedestrian safety. The applicant is not intending to access the site using HGVs. Highways have raised no objections to the proposal and therefore the access is considered to be acceptable and accords with policy T2 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan.

The site is located within flood zone 2/3a. No flood risk assessment has been submitted with the planning application. However, the proposed building is to be used for agricultural purposes (defined as a less vulnerable use in the National Planning Practice Guidance) which results in development being considered acceptable in flood risk terms. Concerns in relation to surface water disposal and access could be dealt with by planning conditions.

The method of manure and foul bedding storage and disposal could be dealt with by planning condition; this is consistent with the condition recommended by Environmental Health. The site will visible from neighbouring properties but is not considered to result in any adverse impact on the residential amenity currently enjoyed by these nearby properties. The use of the land for the storage of vehicles and other vehicle-related paraphernalia is a matter which is under investigation by Planning Enforcement.

RECOMMENDATION Refuse permission for the following reason:

The proposal, by virtue of its design, scale, bulk and siting, would have an adverse impact on the character and appearance of Stockholes Turbary which is located within the Isle of Axholme Area of Special Historic Landscape and is of national significance. In addition, insufficient supporting information has been submitted to justify an agricultural livestock building in this rural location. The proposal is therefore contrary to paragraphs 128,131 and 137 of the National Planning Policy Framework, policies CS5 and CS6 of the Core Strategy and polices RD2 and LC14 of the North Lincolnshire Local Plan.

Informative

In determining this application, the council, as local planning authority, has taken account of the guidance in paragraphs 186 and 187 of the National Planning Policy Framework in order to seek to secure sustainable development that improves the economic, social and environmental conditions of the area.

PA/2017/547 - Site Location



